

External Evaluation of the Indian Health Service Tucson Area Injury Prevention Program: Evaluation Report – Executive Summary

Submitted by:

**Carolyn E. Crump, PhD
Robert J. Letourneau, MPH**

University of North Carolina
Injury Prevention Research Center

Submitted to:

Don Williams, MPH
Tucson Area Injury Prevention Specialist

December 31, 2002

Tucson Area Evaluation Report – Executive Summary

This Executive Summary outlines the major findings outlined in the Tucson Area Injury Prevention Program (IPP) Evaluation Report completed in December 2002 by Carolyn E. Crump, PhD and Robert J. Letourneau, MPH of the University of North Carolina. Included in this Executive Summary are the Program Stage of Development ratings for the 12 Evaluation Components used to guide the evaluation process:

- | | |
|--|---|
| 1. Mission/Vision | 7. Needs Assessment/Defined Service Population |
| 2. Resource Allocation/Accounting | 8. Surveillance Data Collection |
| 3. Management Support | 9. Injury Program Planning and Implementation |
| 4. Staffing/Roles and Responsibilities | 10. Marketing/Advocacy |
| 5. Training | 11. Evaluation/Reporting |
| 6. Partnerships/Collaboration | 12. Technical Assistance/Building Tribal Capacity |

A brief summary of recommendations is also provided in this Executive Summary for each Evaluation Component. Please refer to the full-text version of the Tucson Area Evaluation Report for the following: a) background on the development of the evaluation process; b) summary of the Tucson Area Evaluation Process; c) an overview of the Tucson Area IPP; d) a description of the Program Stage of Development Process; e) contextual factors used to determine stage of development ratings; f) recommendations; and f) a list of resources for Tucson Area IPP staff.

1. Mission/Vision

Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
-------	---------------------	---------------

The Tucson Area Injury Prevention Program (IPP) is at the **Intermediate** stage of development for Mission/Vision. The evaluators recognize the recent revisions to the Tucson Area Injury Prevention Program planning process and encourage that the process of soliciting feedback on the Area's IP Program involve all field staff. In addition, future Area IP Plans should develop outcome objectives specific to both Tribes served by the Tucson Area. It is important that a program planning process involve local data and Tribal feedback (e.g., quantitative and qualitative data). The evaluators recommend that quarterly reporting by field staff follow the same format used in the annual Injury Prevention Program plan, thus field activity can be linked to the objectives specified in the plan. Tucson Area staff should consider developing program/work plans that are based upon the 12 Evaluation Components used for the Area Evaluation. For example, Evaluation Components rated as "basic" could be the priority for the short-term (next 1-2 years) or long-term (next 3-5 years). For each Evaluation Component, staff could list objectives, action steps (with identified staff members responsible for completing), and an appropriate timeline for completing tasks. The Tucson Area IP Program does not currently benefit from regularly scheduled annual meetings, whereby staff come together to discuss past progress and plan future activities related to injury prevention. The evaluators recommend that regular meetings take place in the future. The evaluators recommend that greater participation at annual meetings by Tribal staff be facilitated in order to enhance information sharing about injury prevention efforts underway in the Tucson Area.

2. Resource Allocation/Accounting

Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
--------------	--------------	---------------

The Tucson Area IPP is at the **Basic** stage for Resource Allocation/Accounting. The Acting IP Specialist does not have significant input into the annual budget for the Tucson Area Injury Prevention Program. The evaluators encourage Area administrators to involve the (Acting) Area IP Specialist in the budgetary process. Specifically, the evaluators recommend that the Area IP Specialist prepare an annual draft budget and circulate it among field staff requesting comments/suggested revisions prior to submitting it to Area

administrators. The annual spending budget should include a list of possible activities requiring funding (e.g., demonstration projects, equipment purchases, training opportunities). Having this list would help to identify spending priorities should 'year end funds' become available. In addition, the evaluators strongly recommend that a more formalized process of announcing, distributing, and tracking injury prevention program funding be developed in the Tucson Area. Without this, staff conducting injury prevention activities are limited in their abilities to be creative when planning activities. As a first step, the evaluators suggest that the Acting Area IP Specialist develop, with assistance and input from field staff and based on examples developed in other IHS Areas, funding guidelines by which IHS and Tribal staff can apply for funding from the Area Office. Accompanying these funding guidelines, field and Tribal staff should be provided with the criteria by which project proposals will be evaluated/selected for funding. Developing and using such guidelines provides for accountability from project coordinators in completing activities as intended if/once funding is provided. Project activities should also be linked to specific project objectives. In addition, progress reports that are required at mid-year and upon project completion would better enable the Acting Area IP Specialist to monitor project process and document accomplishments.

3. Management Support

Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
-------	---------------------	---------------

The Tucson Area IPP is at the **Intermediate** stage of development for Management Support. Success of injury prevention programs often depends on the support provided by upper management staff at the Area Office and/or Tribal government. While some explicit support for the Tucson Area Injury Prevention program appears to exist among Area Office staff, the creation of a full-time Area Injury Prevention Specialist in the Tucson Area would indicate stronger management support. In addition, the evaluators suggest that additional exposure and discussion regarding the Tucson Area, District, and Service Unit/Tribal injury prevention program activities be developed to educate Service Unit Directors and Tribal leaders about the importance of injury prevention. In the future, it will be important for Tribal IP practitioners at Tohono O'odham Nation and Pascua Yaqui Tribe, with assistance from the Area IP Specialist, to serve as advocates for making injury prevention a priority at their Tribes. Specifically, the evaluators recommend IP staff in the Tucson Area develop a standard oral presentation designed for use with multiple audiences (e.g., SUDs, medical staff, medical records staff, Tribal leaders) that can be modified to include local concerns. In addition, a comprehensive data report showing the severity and consequences of injuries in the Tucson Area would be a useful in informing and educating Tribal leaders about the importance of injury prevention as a priority health issue. Finally, giving injury prevention-related performance awards, a practice in place in several other IHS Areas, should be considered in the Tucson Area, as it provides beneficial recognition for jobs well done.

4. Staffing/Roles and Responsibilities

Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
--------------	--------------	---------------

The Tucson Area IPP is at the **Basic** stage of development for Staffing/Roles and Responsibilities. While an Area Injury Prevention Specialist position was developed and previously filled in the Tucson Area, the position is currently vacant and the Supervisory Sanitarian is serving in an acting capacity as the Area IP Specialist. Given the importance of injury prevention to the overall health of American Indians, it is important for this staffing decision to be reconsidered, such that the staff member designated as the Area IP Specialist have the flexibility and ability to devote more time on injury prevention activities. Back-filling the Area IP Specialist position may foster increased injury prevention activity at the local level, where field staff find it difficult to devote the expected 30 percent of their time on injury prevention. The evaluators also recommend that the Area Injury Prevention Specialist position description be updated, as several of

the duties outlined are outdated. In addition, the evaluators suggest that position descriptions for District and Service Unit staff in the Tucson Area be reviewed and revised to outline more consistent injury prevention job duties and responsibilities. It may also be helpful to outline the expected percentage of time that field staff should devote to injury prevention responsibilities outlined in position descriptions, as this is not explicit in current position descriptions for Service Unit Environmental Health Staff. Given the limited ability to use the COER appraisal system to assess injury prevention performance, the evaluators suggest that supervisors use the annual injury prevention workplans developed by field staff as the basis for providing constructive feedback to field staff on injury prevention performance.

5. Training

Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
-------	--------------	---------------

The Tucson Area IPP is at the **Basic** stage of development for Training. The provision of additional or continued training to IHS staff and Tribal members within the Area would be beneficial. The evaluators recommend that field staff attend training courses at least every five years as a way to remain current in the best practices in injury prevention. The evaluators also recommend that a priority be considered to recruit/hire staff who have either completed the Fellowship Program or who are interested in doing so after starting work in the Tucson Area. In addition, all staff in the Tucson Area should be encouraged to provide active assistance in marketing for and recruitment to future training activities in and outside the Area. Conducting follow-up calls or visits regarding all training announcements/opportunities distributed from the Area Office is one approach to consider. Tailored recruiting of qualified participants for the new Program Development Fellowship would also be beneficial. Follow-up with Tucson Area training program participants after training is provided should also be conducted (e.g., through the development of a training program database). The evaluators recommend that the Tucson Area staff consider developing an abridged Level I training course designed to provide education and information about injury prevention in the Area to Tribal decision-makers. Collaboration with Phoenix Area staff on training activities may also prove beneficial. In addition, the evaluators encourage the Area IP Specialist to consider an approach used in other Areas to focus IP discussions at annual EH/IP meetings (i.e., to share 'lessons learned' or 'success stories'). Finally, as part of the annual Tucson Area program planning process and at regular Tucson Area EH/IP meetings conducted, needs for specialized training (e.g., grant writing) for IP should be identified and addressed. Based on the needs and identified priorities, a set of workshops/courses could be planned for Area-wide participation and/or specific to Service Units/Tribal members. Training on proposal development, budget formulation, budget monitoring, and budget reporting are some examples of training that may prove beneficial for IHS and Tribal staff in the Tucson Area.

6. Partnerships/Collaboration

Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
-------	--------------	---------------

The Tucson Area IPP is at the **Basic** stage of development for Partnerships/ Collaboration. The evaluators concur with staff observations that it can be difficult to maintain local injury prevention coalitions, especially when funding is not available to support them or specific activities. In addition, IHS field staff are often challenged to find the correct balance between leading and facilitating projects for a coalition. The evaluators note that it is incumbent upon IHS staff who participate at local IP coalition meetings to both facilitate the idea-generating process as well as ensure adequate follow-up occurs on the suggested ideas. Having a set of specific ideas and project proposals, perhaps outlined in the annual Tucson Area IP program plan, will assist Tucson Area and District IP staff by focusing their attention on collaborations leading to the joint implementation of specific IP interventions. In an era of diminishing resources, there is much value in spending time to develop relationships and collaborative efforts.

Professionals and those representing other federal, state, and local agencies will more likely support projects if there are clear proposals and the ideas are organized in a timeline with stated goals and objectives with the responsible parties indicated.

7. Needs Assessment/Defined Service Population

Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
-------	--------------	---------------

The Tucson Area IPP is at the **Basic** stage of development for Needs Assessment/Defined Service Population. To move to the next stage of development for this Evaluation Component, Tucson Area, District and Service Unit staff should consider developing more formal procedures to collect needs assessment data. The evaluators recommend that this information be routinely collected as part of a structured way to develop tailored, local-level injury prevention programs in direct response to community member requests. Needs assessment information should be collected from both District and Service Unit Staff (e.g., at annual IPP meetings) as well as with community members (e.g., via local community injury prevention coalitions or as part of a planned needs assessment data collection activity/project). The evaluators recommend that staff in the Tucson Area develop community profiles as a way to present information collected through needs assessments. In addition, the evaluators suggest that Tucson Area staff consider supporting one or more Photovoice projects. This “needs assessment” method promotes critical dialogue and knowledge about personal and community issues (e.g., deaths occurring along Highway 86) through large and small group discussions of photographs, which has the potential to reach policy makers. Photovoice goes beyond the conventional role of community assessment by inviting people to promote their and their community's well-being. Finally, the Tucson Area IPP should consider developing a Tucson Area Tribal Injury Prevention Program Steering Committee to identify the Tucson Area IP needs (e.g., training, funding, projects) for the Pascua Yaqui and Tohono O’odham Tribes.

8. Surveillance Data Collection

Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
-------	--------------	---------------

The Tucson Area IPP is at the **Basic** stage of development for Surveillance Data Collection. It is notable that the Severe Injury Surveillance System currently being developed in the Tucson Area will centralize data collection and reporting efforts, which is an appropriate approach for a comparatively small IHS Service Area. The evaluators encourage the Area IP Specialist to facilitate a process whereby all Tucson Area staff have the opportunity to provide feedback on the injury surveillance protocols being developed and implemented. Specifically, the development, pre-test, and roll-out of the new severe surveillance report forms should be discussed with all staff within the Area. Once this system is implemented, the acting Area IP Specialist will be responsible for providing technical assistance (on-site) to Tribal/medical staff providing the data and/or IHS staff collecting local data. The evaluators also recommend that Tucson Area staff continue to use the Phoenix Area Severe Injury Surveillance Protocol/Manual as a model for ideas on what to include in the Tucson Area protocols. To improve observational data collection, observational protocols used by Service Unit staff should also be standardized across Service Units and included in the protocols. Given that the surveillance system will require the Acting Area IP Specialist to analyze and create injury data reports, time allowed to do so will be imperative. Back-filling a full-time Area IP Specialist in the Tucson Area Office will allow for time and effort required to develop and maintain an effective injury surveillance system. The continued practicing of hiring a COSTEP to work with the IP Program’s surveillance efforts should also prove beneficial.

9. Injury Program Planning and Implementation

Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
-------	--------------	---------------

The Tucson Area IPP is at the **Basic** stage of development for Injury Program Planning and Implementation. As described in the Resource Allocation/Accounting evaluation component, the evaluators recommend that a more formalized process of announcing, distributing, and tracking injury prevention program funding be developed in the Tucson Area. To increase the effectiveness of program activities, the evaluators also encourage the staff to support a greater percentage of multiple level interventions (e.g., individual, vehicle/vector and environmental change) and should use multiple methods (e.g., health education, engineering, policy development, and enforcement). To enhance this evaluation component, the evaluators recommend that Tucson Area staff develop a strategic approach to reduce injury related morbidity and mortality by specifically incorporating the four types of interventions outlined in the IOM's *Reducing the Burden of Injury Report* (Bonnie et al., 1999): 1) changing individual behavior; 2) modifying products or agents of injury; 3) modifying the physical environment; and 4) modifying the sociocultural and economic environment. Given the limited amount of and difficulty in collecting local injury morbidity and mortality data to date in the Tucson Area, it is appropriate for Area and District staff to encourage Tribes to develop and implement intervention projects that are considered 'proven interventions' (e.g., occupant restraint; smoke alarm distribution). While Tucson Area IPP staff are not expected to take full responsibility for preventing intentional injuries, staff with IP responsibilities can contribute significantly to these efforts. Intentional injuries are appropriate to address given that the Tucson Area has the highest age-adjusted homicide rate among all IHS Areas. To do so, staff are encouraged to build collaborative relationships with IHS Area departments and other organizations responsible for alcohol abuse prevention/treatment and mental health.

10. Marketing

Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
-------	--------------	---------------

The Tucson Area IPP is at the **Basic** stage of development for Marketing. Injury prevention marketing and advocacy activities are under development in the Tucson Area. The evaluators recommend that producing a separate Tucson Area Injury Prevention Program summary or brochure would be an excellent way to enhance this evaluation component. In addition to this summary/brochure, the evaluators suggest that future marketing tools, such as an Tucson Area Fact Sheet, be developed to correspond to major program emphasis areas of the program. The formation of a Tucson Area-specific Injury Prevention Program webpage would also be beneficial and could become integrated with the recently revised IHS National Injury Prevention Program website. All materials developed to market the Area's program should be updated and distributed annually to the Area's list of Tucson Area injury prevention practitioners or partners. The evaluators note that the current Area Director's Awards could become an excellent avenue for marketing the Area Injury Prevention Program. Changes to the award process to include awards for injury prevention should be considered. The development of Injury Prevention Program marketing presentations for Tribal leaders is also a recommendation. To the extent possible, a standardized format for these presentations should be developed, so that consistent messages are communicated to Tribal leaders. These presentations should be delivered to local communities as well as at meetings of Tribal leaders and/or IHS Program meetings (e.g., medical directors, Service Unit Directors). Materials in the Resources section of this report will assist Tucson Area staff to develop marketing materials.

11. Evaluation/Reporting

Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
-------	--------------	---------------

The Tucson Area IPP is at the **Basic** stage of Development for Evaluation/Reporting. For the Tucson Area Injury Prevention Program to advance to the next stage of development for this Evaluation Component, more formal evaluation and reporting mechanisms should be put in place to monitor injury prevention intervention projects implemented at the Service Unit/Tribal level. Specifically, evaluation and reporting guidelines should be included in award letters sent to funded intervention project coordinators (i.e., included in funding application materials). Funding provided to Tribes through the Tucson Area project funding process does not appear to be based on project evaluation. A standardized reporting format should be developed and included in future funding awards supporting intervention projects. Related to this, the evaluators recommend that the Acting Area IP Specialist develop a set of “indicators of success” (e.g., extent to which collaboration/partnership was established, number of people involved/reached, extent to which the capacity of the Tribe was developed) for Tribal project coordinators to use when reporting accomplishments of their projects. The evaluators also recommend that better documentation of project funding take place (e.g., uses of project equipment purchased over time). Additional follow-up and documentation regarding the distribution of car seats could also be conducted. Carseat use should be assessed on a regular basis (i.e., annually, semi-annually). To determine use, methods should be implemented at formal carseat check roadblocks or during observations at fixed locations such as a Head Start Center. The Acting Area IP Specialist should also annually document the accomplishments of Service Unit/Tribal injury prevention activities. Documenting successes as well as challenges, including a report of how funds were allotted, will improve program planning at the Area, District, and Service Unit Levels. Staff in the Tucson Area would likely benefit from advanced training in evaluation methods.

12. Technical Assistance/Building Tribal Capacity

Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
-------	--------------	---------------

The Tucson Area IPP is between the **Basic** stage of development for Technical Assistance/Building Tribal Capacity. With the advent of the IHS Tribal Injury Prevention Cooperative Agreements Program funding to Tribes, it is important for Tucson Area, District, and Service Unit Office IP staff to provide technical assistance to all Tribal Organizations in the Tucson Area interested in working to prevent injuries and/or to submit proposals for grant funding. Tucson Area IP staff understand the importance of and are committed to building the capacity Tribal members in injury prevention. All Tucson Area IP staff should be proactive in the way in which they work with Tribal representatives to advocate for and make suggestions about potential IP activities. Capacity building efforts through training have been successful at the Pascua Yaqui Tribe and therefore the evaluators encourages that a similar approach be used with key staff involved with IP activities at Tohono O’odham Nation. Establishing a Tucson Area Tribal Injury Prevention Steering Committee may also raise awareness of the importance of IP among both Tribes in the Tucson Area. This committee could be encouraged to develop a relationship with State and Regional programs that address specific issues important to the safety of Tribal members (e.g., domestic violence, crime prevention, highway improvements).

Tucson Area Evaluation Report – Executive Summary

In summary, the Tucson Area Injury Prevention Program is at the following Stages of Development for the 12 Evaluation Components used to guide the Evaluation:

Evaluation Component	Stage of Development		
	Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
1. Mission/Vision	Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
2. Resource Allocation/Accounting	Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
3. Management Support	Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
4. Staffing/Roles & Responsibilities	Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
5. Training	Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
6. Partnerships/Collaboration	Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
7. Needs Assessment/Defined Service Population	Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
8. Surveillance Data Collection	Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
9. Injury Program Planning and Implementation	Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
10. Marketing	Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
11. Evaluation/Reporting	Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive
12. Technical Assistance/Building Tribal Capacity	Basic	Intermediate	Comprehensive

Tucson Area Injury Prevention Program staff should use the results, recommendations, and resources provided in this report to develop an Action Plan to enhance the stages of development for each Evaluation Component used in this assessment process.